

The Emancipation Proclamation Political Ploy or Courageous Gamble?

by Jonathan Burack

Each unit in *The Historian's Apprentice* series deals with an important historical topic. It introduces students to a five-step set of practices designed to simulate the experience of being a historian and make explicit all key phases of the historian's craft.

The Historian's Apprentice: A Five-Step Process

- Reflect on Your Prior Knowledge of the Topic
 Students discuss what they already know and how their prior knowledge may shape or distort the way they view the topic.
- 2. Apply Habits of Historical Thinking to the Topic
 Students build background knowledge on the basis of five habits of thinking that historians use in constructing accounts of the past.
- **3. Interpret the Relevant Primary Sources**Students apply a set of rules for interpreting sources and assessing their relevance and usefulness.
- 4. Assess the Interpretations of Other Historians Students learn to read secondary sources actively, with the goal of deciding among competing interpretations based on evidence in the sources.
- **5. Interpret, Debate, and Write About the Topic Yourself**Students apply what they have learned by constructing evidence-based interpretations of their own in a variety of ways.

Samples are provided for evaluation purposes. Copying of the product or its parts for resale is prohibited. Additional restrictions may be set by the publisher.





©2009 MindSparks, a division of Social Studies School Service All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America

MindSparks 10200 Jefferson Boulevard., P.O. Box 802 Culver City, CA 90232-0802 United States of America

(310) 839-2436 (800) 421-4246

http://mindsparks.com access@mindsparks.com

Only those pages intended for student use as handouts may be reproduced by the teacher who has purchased this volume. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means—electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording—without prior written permission from the publisher.

ISBN: 978-1-57596-286-3 Product Code: HS362 v2.0

Teacher Introduction



Teaching the Historian's Craft

The goal of *The Historian's Apprentice* units is to expose students in a manageable way to the complex processes by which historians practice their craft. By modeling what historians do, students will practice the full range of skills that make history the unique and uniquely valuable challenge that it is.

Modeling the historian's craft is not the same as being a historian - something few students will become. Therefore, a scaffolding is provided here to help students master historical content in a way that will be manageable and useful to them.

Historical thinking is not a simple matter of reciting one fact after another, or even of mastering a single, authoritative account. It is disciplined by evidence, and it is a quest for truth; yet, historians usually try to

clarify complex realities and make tentative judgments, not to draw final conclusions. In doing so, they wrestle with imperfect sets of evidence (the primary sources), detect multiple meanings embedded in those sources, and take into account varying interpretations by other historians. They also recognize how wide a divide separates the present from earlier times. Hence, they work hard to avoid presentmindedness and to achieve empathy with people who were vastly different from us.

In their actual practice, historians are masters of the cautious, qualified conclusion. Yet they engage, use their imaginations, and debate with vigor. It is this spirit and these habits of craft that The Historian's Apprentice seeks to instill in students.



The Historian's Apprentice: Five Steps in Four Parts

The Historian's Apprentice is a five-step process. However, the materials presented here are organized into four parts. Part I deals with the first two of the five steps of the process. Each of the other three parts then deals with one step in the process. Here is a summary of the four parts into which the materials are organized:

- **Teacher Introduction.** Includes suggested day-by-day sequences for using these materials, including options for using the PowerPoint presentations. One sequence is designed for younger students and supplies a page of vocabulary definitions.
- Part 1. A student warm-up activity, an introductory essay, a handout detailing a set of habits of historical thinking, and two PowerPoint presentations (Five Habits of Historical Thinking and The Emancipation Proclamation: Political Ploy or Courageous Gamble?). Part 1 (including the PowerPoints) deals with The Historian's Apprentice Steps 1 and 2.
- Part 2. A checklist for analyzing primary sources, several primary sources, and worksheets for analyzing them. Part 2 deals with *The Historian's Apprentice* Step 3.
- Part 3. Two secondary source passages and two student activities analyzing those passages. Part 3 deals with The Historian's Apprentice Step 4.
- Part 4. Two optional follow-up activities enabling students to write about and/or debate their own interpretations of the topic. Part 4 deals with The Historian's Apprentice Step 5.



Suggested Five-Day Sequence

Below is one possible way to use this *Historian's Apprentice* unit. Tasks are listed day by day in a sequence taking five class periods, with some homework and some optional follow-up activities.

PowerPoint Presentation: Five Habits of Historical Thinking. This presentation comes with each Historian's Apprentice unit. If you have used it before with other units, you need not do so again. If you decide to use it, incorporate it into the **Day 1** activities. In either case, give students the "Five Habits of Historical Thinking" handout for future reference. Those "five habits" are as follows:

- History Is Not the Past Itself
- The Detective Model: Problem, Evidence, Interpretation
- Time, Change, and Continuity
- Cause and Effect
- As They Saw It: Grasping Past Points of View

Warm-Up Activity. Homework assignment: Students do the *Warm-Up Activity*. This activity explores students' memories and personal experiences shaping their understanding of the topic.

Day 1: Discuss the *Warm-Up Activity*, then either have students read or review the "Five Habits of Historical Thinking" handout, or use the *Five Habits PowerPoint* presentation.

Homework assignment: Students read the background essay "The Emancipation Proclamation Debate."

Day 2: Use the second PowerPoint presentation, *The Emancipation Proclamation*, to provide an overview of the topic for this lesson. The presentation applies the Five Habits of Historical Thinking to this topic. Do the two activities embedded in the presentation.

Homework assignment: Students read the "Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist." The checklist teaches a systematic way to handle sources:

- Sourcing
- Contextualizing
- Interpreting meanings
- Point of view
- Corroborating sources

Day 3: In class, students study some of the ten primary source documents and complete "Source Analysis" worksheets on them. They use their notes to discuss these sources. (Worksheet questions are all based on the concepts on the "Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist.")

Day 4: In class, students complete the remaining "Source Analysis" worksheets and use their notes to discuss these sources. Take some time to briefly discuss the two secondary source passages students will analyze next.

Homework assignment: Student read these two secondary source passages.

Day 5: In class, students do the two "Secondary Sources" activities and discuss them. These activities ask them to analyze the two secondary source passages using four criteria:

- Clear focus on a problem or question
- Position or point of view
- Use of evidence or sources
- Awareness of alternative explanations

Follow-Up Activities (optional, at teacher's discretion).

Do as preferred: the DBQ Essay Assignment and/or the Structured Debate.



Suggested Three-Day Sequence

If you have less time to devote to this lesson, here is a suggested shorter sequence. The sequence does not include the PowerPoint presentation Five Habits of Historical Thinking. This presentation is included with each Historian's Apprentice unit. If you have never used it with your class, you may want to do so before following this three-day sequence.

The three-day sequence leaves out a few activities from the five-day sequence. It also suggests that you use only six key primary sources. However, it still walks students through the steps of the Historian's Apprentice approach: clarifying background knowledge, analyzing primary sources, comparing secondary sources, and debating or writing about the topic.

- Warm-Up Activity. Homework assignment: Ask students to read or review the "Five Habits of Historical Thinking" handout and read the background essay "The Emancipation Proclamation Debate."
- Day 1: Use the PowerPoint presentation The Emancipation Proclamation. It provides an overview of the topic for this lesson by applying the Five Habits of Historical Thinking to it. Do the two activities embedded in the presentation.
 - Homework assignment: Students read or review the "Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist." The checklist teaches a systematic way to handle sources.
- Day 2: In class, students study some of the ten primary source documents and complete "Source Analysis" worksheets on them. They then use their notes to discuss these sources. Documents 1, 3, 4, 6, 7, and 8 are suggested.

You may wish to make your own choices of primary sources. Use your judgment in deciding how many of them your students can effectively analyze in a single class period.

Homework assignment: Student read the two secondary source passages.

- Day 3: In class, students do the two "Secondary Sources" activities and discuss them. These activities ask them to analyze the two secondary source passages using four criteria.
- Follow-Up Activities (optional, at teacher's discretion):

Do as preferred: the DBQ Essay Assignment and/or the Structured Debate.



Suggestions for Use with Younger Students

For younger students, parts of this lesson may prove challenging. If you feel your students need a somewhat more manageable path through the material, see the suggested sequence below.

If you want to use the *Five Habits of Historical Thinking* PowerPoint presentation, this sequence takes four class periods. If you do not use this PowerPoint, you can combine **Day 1** and **Day 2** and keep the sequence to just three days. We suggest using five primary sources only. The ones listed for **Day 3** are less demanding in terms of vocabulary and conceptual complexity. For **Day 4**, we provide some simpler DBQs for the follow-up activities.

Vocabulary: A list of vocabulary terms in the sources and the introductory essay is provided on page 7 of this booklet. You may wish to hand this sheet out as a reading reference, you could make flashcards out of some of the terms, or you might ask each of several small groups to use the vocabulary sheet to explain terms found in one source to the rest of the class.

SUGGESTED FOUR-DAY SEQUENCE

- **Warm-Up Activity. Homework assignment:** Students do the Warm-Up Activity. This activity explores students' memories and personal experiences shaping their understanding of the topic.
- **Day 1:** Discuss the Warm-Up Activity. Show the *Five Habits of Historical Thinking* PowerPoint presentation (unless you have used it before and/or you do not think it is needed now). If you do not use this PowerPoint presentation, give students the "Five Habits of Historical Thinking" handout and discuss it with them.
 - **Homework assignment:** Ask students to read the background essay, "The Emancipation Proclamation Debate."
- **Day 2:** Use the PowerPoint presentation *The Emancipation Proclamation*. This introduces the topic for the lesson by applying the Five Habits of Historical Thinking to it. Do the two activities embedded in the presentation.
 - **Homework assignment:** Students read or review the "Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist." The checklist offers a systematic way to handle sources.
- **Day 3:** Discuss the "Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist" and talk through one primary source document in order to illustrate the meaning of the concepts on the checklist. Next, have students complete "Source Analysis" worksheets after studying primary source documents 1, 4, 6, 8, and 10.
 - **Homework assignment:** Students read the two secondary source passages.
- **Day 4:** Students do only "Secondary Sources: Activity 2" and discuss it. This activity asks them to choose the two primary sources that best back up each secondary source passage.
- **Follow-Up Activities** (optional, at teacher's discretion):

Do as preferred: the DBQ Essay Assignment and/or the Structured Debate.

Here are some alternative DBQs tailored to the six primary sources recommended here:

What was Abraham Lincoln's main reason for issuing the Emancipation Proclamation when he did?

Explain why you do or do not agree with this statement: "Lincoln intended to end slavery no matter what, once the Civil War started."

Vocabulary: The Introductory Essay

- Cabinet: In this case, the U.S. president's group of top department heads and advisers
- "compensated emancipation": Freeing slaves by paying their owners for them
- **confiscated:** Seized or appropriated under authority for public use
- contraband of war: Property seized from an enemy during war
- "cynical political ploy": acting for political gain with contempt for moral principles
- **emancipation:** The act of setting free, in this case from slavery
- preliminary: Introductory, or leading up to a main event
- secession: The act of seceding or withdrawing from a larger group or union

Vocabulary: The Primary Sources

- abrasion: An area that has been scraped or rubbed
- appropriations: Money authorized or set aside for a particular use
- **censure:** Blame or criticism
- clevis: A metal fitting with holes through which a bolt is passed to attach it to a chain or rod
- constituents: The citizens an elected official represents
- countervailing: Going against
- **designated:** Indicated or named for some purpose
- disaffected: Losing affection and becoming dissatisfied
- "federal authority": The authority of the federal government, as opposed to that of the states
- **forfeit:** To lose the right to something
- initiate: Begin
- in lieu of: In place of, or instead of
- insurrection: Rebellion
- **pecuniary:** Having to do with money

Vocabulary: The Secondary Sources

- bill of lading: A document issued by a carrier listing goods to be shipped
- Crittendon Resolution (1861): It reassured border states the war was not waged to abolish slavery
- conservatives: Politically active people who seek to preserve or restore what is traditional
- consistency: Always acting so as to maintain a standard
- **enumeration:** A listing or numbering of items
- forestall: To prevent something
- **indictment:** A charge against, or statement of condemnation
- integrity: Acting regularly in accordance with high moral principles
- propaganda: Efforts to persuade, especially through distortions and emotional appeals
- prudence: Acting cautiously with discipline, reason, and good judgment
- quashed: Crushed or rejected
- salient: Prominent or noticeable

Part 1: The Emancipation Proclamation Providing the Context

Note to the teacher: The next pages provide materials meant to help students develop a clear picture of what the Emancipation Proclamation was and why historians still disagree about it. The materials also seek to teach students the Five Habits of Historical Thinking.

This section includes the following:

• PowerPoint presentation: The Five Habits of Historical Thinking

This presentation illustrates five habits of thought or modes of analysis that guide historians as they construct their secondary accounts of a topic. These five habits are not about skills used in analyzing primary sources. (Those are dealt with more explicitly in another handout in the next section.) These five habits of historical thinking are meant to help students see history as a way of thinking, not as the memorizing of disparate facts and pre-digested conclusions. The PowerPoint uses several historical episodes as examples to illustrate the five habits. In two places, it pauses to ask students to do a simply activity applying one of the habits to some of their own life experiences.

If you have used this PowerPoint with other *Historian's Apprentice* units, you may not need to use it again here.

Handout: "The Five Habits of Historical Thinking"

This handout supplements the PowerPoint presentation. It is meant as a reference for students to use as needed. If you have used other Historian's Apprentice units, your students may only need to review this handout quickly.

Warm-Up Activity

A simple exercise designed to help you see what students know about the Emancipation Proclamation, what confuses them, or what ideas they may have absorbed about it from popular culture, friends and family, etc. The goal is to alert them to their need to gain a clearer idea of the past and be critical of what they think they already know.

Introductory essay: "The Emancipation Proclamation Debate"

The essay provides enough basic background information on the topic to enable students to assess primary sources and conflicting secondary source interpretations. At the end of the essay, students get some points to keep in mind about the nature of the sources they will examine and the conflicting secondary source interpretations they will debate.

PowerPoint presentation: The Emancipation Proclamation: Political Ploy or Courageous Gamble?

This PowerPoint presentation reviews the topic for the lesson and shows how the Five Habits of Historical Thinking can be applied to a clearer understanding of it. At two points, the presentation calls for a pause and students are prompted to discuss some aspects of their prior knowledge of the topic. It is suggested that you use this PowerPoint presentation after assigning the introductory essay, but you may prefer to reverse this order.

Warm-Up Activity

What Do You Know About the Civil War?

This lesson deals with the Emancipation Proclamation, issued during the Civil War. Whenever you start to learn about a time in history, it helps to think first of what you already know about it, or think you know. You probably have impressions. Or you may have read or heard things about it already. Some of what you know may be accurate. You need to be ready to alter your fixed ideas about this time as you learn more about it. This is what any historian would do. For now, study this illustration and take a few notes on the questions below it.



This drawing shows African Americans flocking to join soldiers marching into the South in the early 1860s. What do you know about the events that caused this to take place?

Were any of your ancestors involved in the Civil War in any way? If so, what do you know about their experiences? How have these experiences influenced your own views about the Civil War?

Have you ever seen films on the Civil War, such as Glory, or Gone with the Wind? What impression do you get about the conflict from such films?