

DOCUMENTS

Interpreting Alternative Viewpoints
in Primary Source Documents

Globalization Yesterday and Today

*A globally linked world actually emerged centuries ago.
What is unique and challenging about globalization today?*



Samples are provided for evaluation purposes. Copying of the product or its parts for resale is prohibited. Additional restrictions may be set by the publisher.

Debating the DOCUMENTS

Interpreting Alternative Viewpoints
in Primary Source Documents

Globalization Yesterday and Today

The 2017 World History Course and Exam Description of the College Board Advanced Placement Program* lists five themes that it urges teachers to use in organizing their teaching. Each World History *Debating the Documents* booklet focuses on one or two of these five themes.

The Five Themes

- 1. Interaction between humans and the environment.** (demography and disease; migration; patterns of settlement; technology)
- 2. Development and interaction of cultures.** (religions; belief systems, philosophies, and ideologies; science and technology; the arts and architecture)
- 3. State-building, expansion, and conflict.** (political structures and forms of governance; empires; nations and nationalism; revolts and revolutions; regional, transregional, and global structures and organizations)
- 4. Creation, expansion, and interaction of economic systems.** (agricultural and pastoral production; trade and commerce; labor systems; industrialization; capitalism and socialism)
- 5. Development and transformation of social structures.** (gender roles and relations; family and kinship; racial and ethnic constructions; social and economic classes)

This Booklet's Main Themes:

- 2** Development and interaction of cultures.
- 4** Creation, expansion, and interaction of economic systems.

* AP and Advanced Placement Program are registered trademarks of the College Entrance Examination Board, which was not involved in the production of and does not endorse this booklet.

MindSparks®

CULVER CITY, CALIFORNIA

Contents

Teacher Introduction	1
Suggestions to the Student	5
Introductory Essay	6
Globalization Time Line	7
First Group of Documents	8
Study the Documents	10
Comparing the Documents	12
Comparison Essay	13
Second Group of Documents	14
Study the Documents	16
Comparing the Documents	18
Comparison Essay	19
Document-Based Question	20
Worksheet Answers and Guidelines	21
Visual Primary Sources	23

Teacher Introduction

★ Using Primary Sources

Primary sources are called “primary” because they are first-hand records of a past era or historical event. They are the raw materials, or the evidence, on which historians base their “secondary” accounts of the past.

A rapidly growing number of history teachers today are using primary sources. Why? Perhaps it's because primary sources give students a better sense of what history is and what historians do. Such sources also help students see the past from a variety of viewpoints. Moreover, primary sources make history vivid and bring it to life.

However, primary sources are not easy to use. They can be confusing. They can be biased. They rarely all agree. Primary sources must be interpreted and set in context. To do this, students need historical background knowledge. *Debating the Documents* helps students handle such challenges by giving them a useful framework for analyzing sources that conflict with one another.



*“Multiple,
conflicting
perspectives are
among the truths
of history.
No single
objective or
universal account
could ever put an
end to this endless
creative dialogue
within and
between the past
and the present.”*

From the 2011 Statement on Standards of Professional Conduct of the Council of the American Historical Association.

INTRODUCTION

★ *The Debating the Documents Series*

Each *Debating the Documents* booklet includes the same sequence of reproducible worksheets. If students use several booklets over time, they will get regular practice at interpreting and comparing conflicting sources. In this way, they can learn the skills and habits needed to get the most out of primary sources.

Each *Debating the Documents* Booklet Includes

- **Suggestions for the Student and an Introductory Essay.** The student gets instructions and a one-page essay providing background on the booklet's topic. A time line on the topic is also included.
- **Two Groups of Contrasting Primary Source Documents.** In most of the booklets, students get one pair of visual sources and one pair of written sources. In some cases, more than two are provided for each. Background is provided on each source. *Within each group, the sources clash in a very clear way.* (The sources are not always exact opposites, but they do always differ in some obvious way.)
- **Three Worksheets for Each Document Group.** Students use the first two worksheets to take notes on the sources. The third worksheet asks which source the student thinks would be most useful to a historian.
- **One DBQ.** On page 20, a document-based question (DBQ) asks students to write an effective essay using all of the booklet's primary sources.

★ *How to Use This Booklet*

1. Have students read “Suggestions for the Student” and the Introductory Essay.

Give them copies of pages 5–7. Ask them to read the instructions and then read the introductory essay on the topic. The time line gives them additional information on that topic. This reading could be done in class or as a homework assignment.

2. Have students do the worksheets.

Make copies of the worksheets and the pages with the sources. Ask students to study the background information on each source and the source itself. Then have them take notes on the sources using the worksheets. If students have access to a computer, have them review the primary sources digitally.

NOTE: If you are using these materials with an AP world history class, an honors class, or some other group of advanced and/or more knowledgeable students, you may want to make more written sources available to them on this topic. Do a basic Internet search for sources that provide additional perspectives and then add to the sources provided here.

3. “Debate the documents” as a class.

Have students use their worksheet notes to debate the primary source documents as a class. Urge students to follow these ground rules:

- Use your worksheets as a guide for the discussion or debate.
- Try to reach agreement about the main ideas and the significance of each primary source document.
- Look for points of agreement as well as disagreement between the primary sources.
- Listen closely to all points of view about each primary source.
- Focus on the usefulness of each source to the historian, not merely on whether you agree or disagree with that source’s point of view.

4. Have students do the final DBQ.

A DBQ is an essay question about a set of primary source documents. To answer the DBQ, students write essays using evidence from the sources and their own background knowledge of the historical era. (See the next page for a DBQ scoring guide to use in evaluating these essays.)

The DBQ assignment on page 20 includes guidelines for writing a DBQ essay. Here are some additional points to make with students about preparing to write this kind of essay.

The DBQ for this Booklet (see page 20):

Using the sources provided, describe some of the key similarities and differences between globalization in the 1600s and 1700s, and globalization during the 20th century.

- Analyze the question carefully.
- Use your background knowledge to set sources in their historical context.
- Question and interpret sources actively. Do not accept them at face value.
- Use sources meaningfully to support your essay’s thesis.
- Pay attention to the overall organization of your essay.

INTRODUCTION

★ *Complete DBQ Scoring Guide*

Use this guide in evaluating the DBQ for this booklet. Use this scoring guide with students who are already familiar with using primary sources and writing DBQ essays.

Excellent Essay

- Offers a clear answer or thesis explicitly addressing all aspects of the essay question.
- Does a careful job of interpreting many or most of the documents and relating them clearly to the thesis and the DBQ. Deals with conflicting documents effectively.
- Uses details and examples effectively to support the thesis and other main ideas. Explains the significance of those details and examples well.
- Uses background knowledge and the documents in a balanced way.
- Is well written; clear transitions make the essay easy to follow from point to point. Only a few minor writing errors or errors of fact.

Good Essay

- Offers a reasonable thesis addressing the essential points of the essay question.
- Adequately interprets at least some of the documents and relates them to the thesis and the DBQ.
- Usually relates details and examples meaningfully to the thesis or other main ideas.
- Includes some relevant background knowledge.
- May have some writing errors or errors of fact, as long as these do not invalidate the essay's overall argument or point of view.

Fair Essay

- Offers at least a partly developed thesis addressing the essay question.
- Adequately interprets at least a few of the documents.
- Relates only a few of the details and examples to the thesis or other main ideas.
- Includes some background knowledge.
- Has several writing errors or errors of fact that make it harder to understand the essay's overall argument or point of view.

Poor Essay

- Offers no clear thesis or answer addressing the DBQ.
- Uses few documents effectively other than referring to them in “laundry list” style, with no meaningful relationship to a thesis or any main point.
- Uses details and examples unrelated to the thesis or other main ideas. Does not explain the significance of these details and examples.
- Is not clearly written, with some major writing errors or errors of fact.

Suggestions to the Student

★ *Using Primary Sources*

A primary source is any record of evidence from the past. Many things are primary sources: letters, diary entries, official documents, photos, cartoons, wills, maps, charts, etc. They are called “primary” because they are first-hand records of a past event or time period. This *Debating the Documents* lesson is based on two groups of primary source documents. Within each group, the sources conflict with one another. That is, they express different or even opposed points of view. You need to decide which source is more reliable, more useful, or more typical of the time period. This is what historians do all the time. Usually, you will be able to learn something about the past from each source, even when the sources clash with one another in dramatic ways.

★ *How to Use This Booklet*

1. **Read the one-page introductory essay.**

This gives you background information that will help you analyze the primary source documents and do the exercises for this *Debating the Documents* lesson. The time line gives you additional information you will find helpful.



2. **Study the primary source documents for this lesson.**

For this lesson, you get two groups of sources. The sources within each group conflict with one another. Some of these sources are visuals, others are written sources. With visual sources, pay attention not only to the image’s “content” (its subject matter) but also to its artistic style, shading, composition, camera angle, symbols, and other features that add to the image’s meaning. With written sources, notice the writing style, bias, even what the source leaves out or does not talk about. Think about each source’s author, that author’s reasons for writing, and the likely audience for the source. These considerations give you clues as to the source’s historical value.

3. **Use the worksheets to analyze each group of primary source documents.**

For each group of sources, you get three worksheets. Use the “Study the Document” worksheets to take notes on each source. Use the “Comparing the Documents” worksheet to decide which of the sources would be most useful to a historian.

4. **As a class, debate the documents.**

Use your worksheet notes to help you take part in this debate.

5. **Do the final DBQ.**

“DBQ” means “document-based question.” A DBQ is a question along with several primary source documents. To answer the DBQ, write an essay using evidence from the documents and your own background history knowledge.

Globalization: Yesterday and Today

In recent years, debates about “globalization” have generated books, conferences, protests, marches, and bitter clashes with police in cities around the world. These political and intellectual battles reflect the fact we are all deeply affected now by trends linking all regions of the world in increasingly close and complex interactions.

In this globalization debate, people often think they are arguing about some new, revolutionary development. In fact, globalization is not new at all. In one sense, human migration became fully global thousands of years ago, when small hunter-gatherer bands crossed the Bering Strait and entered the Americas. In 1492, when Columbus made landfall in the Caribbean, globalization took another huge step forward, as humans achieved an awareness of their presence in every region of the world.

From then on, global economic, political, cultural, and environmental patterns of interaction began to grow deeper and wider with each decade.

Looking back, this process may not seem to have been truly “global” because of who carried it out. Before the twentieth century, the main agents of globalization were the powerful industrial states of the West—Spain, Great Britain, France, the United States, and a few others. As they established their colonial empires, they spread their influence around the globe. Free-market capitalism and modern science and technology began to disrupt and refashion economic and social life everywhere. By the late 1800s, international trade was deepening ties among all regions of the world rapidly.

Then came World War I, the Great Depression, World War II, a Cold War rivalry that split the world into two hostile camps, decolonization, and the collapse of the West’s worldwide empires. It may be that globalization today seems new in part because of how these events disrupted a much older process.

In any case, the major Cold War rivalry between the Soviet Union and the Western democracies ended in 1991, when the Soviet Union itself fell apart. Meanwhile, new technologies such as computers and the Internet were vastly increasing the speed and scale of communication, financial transactions, and planning across all national boundaries. Trade agreements, large corporations and several international organizations have facilitated a huge increase in economic, social, and cultural exchanges of all sorts.

Some fear all of these developments. They protest trade policies they see as favoring huge multinational corporations and undercutting local farmers and businesses. They react against the huge income gap between rich and poor nations that grew rapidly in the twentieth century. They reject a spreading cultural uniformity, as commercialized popular culture undermines traditional social and cultural diversity. Some fear trends that weaken the nation-state and enhance the authority of transnational institutions; others dread conflicts arising due to wealth gaps and perceived threats to national and cultural independence.

Yet many view globalization more positively. Thomas Friedman, for example, sees it as simply “enabling individuals, corporations and nation-states to reach round the world farther, faster, deeper and cheaper than ever before.” Some say the growing market economies of India and China prove that any poor nation can achieve industrial growth. Economists note that India and China’s surges have begun to narrow the income gap between rich and poor nations overall. In time, they say, other poor nations will follow. In the meantime, they believe, global linkages are bringing people closer and laying the groundwork for a new, more harmonious world order.

Now, with these sources, you can better understand and begin to take part in these debates yourself.

Globalization Time Line

1400s–1500s

Portugal establishes an overseas trading empire in the Indian Ocean. Columbus lands in the Bahamas, opening the Americas to Spanish conquest. Growing Spanish settlements result in the destruction of many native societies, and an exchange of crops, diseases, domesticated animals, and many other resources between Europe and the Americas. Africa contributes to these exchanges via the Atlantic slave trade and New World plantation slavery.

1600s–1700s

The British, French, Dutch, and some others follow Spain and Portugal in exploring and setting up colonies in the Americas and southeast Asia. Trade across the Atlantic and with Asia via the Indian Ocean intensifies. The Atlantic slave trade reaches its height, but Europeans conquer and colonize little of Africa's interior. The British and French begin to take control of parts of India.

1800s

Great Britain undergoes the earliest phase of the Industrial Revolution. Its machine technology, railroads, steamships, factories, and free-market economic and legal systems begin to spread and affect other European nations, North America, and in time, many other parts of the world. In the late 1800s, a "scramble for Africa" leads European nations to divide up much of Africa. China is divided into "spheres of influence." World trade grows rapidly.

1900–1945

World War I devastates Europe and drastically undermines the authority of the West in ruling its colonial dependencies. The Bolshevik uprising transforms Russia into the world's first communist state and turns it against the rest of the capitalist Western powers. The Great Depression of the 1930s renews turmoil and brings Hitler to power. Japan seeks a huge Asian empire of its own. World War II results in chaos even greater than that produced by World War I. The outcome of the war leaves the world still split, but now into two camps: a communist bloc and a Western capitalist democratic bloc. Decolonization begins, and Europe's colonial empires will largely disappear over the next 25 years.

1944–1948

The Bretton Woods Conference of 1944 plans the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund as institutions designed to regulate the postwar monetary order and provide aid to developing nations. In 1945, the United Nations is established. In 1948, the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) is signed, providing a process for lowering tariffs and setting rules to open national markets to international trade. Defenders and critics of globalization will argue for decades about the relative good or harm these institutions do.

1976

China's Mao Zedong dies. Liberalization of China's communist system soon begins, launching China on a path of rapid economic growth and trade.

1989–1991

The communist systems of the Soviet Union and its Eastern European satellite states collapse. This alters global power relations and contributes to talk of an emerging new world order. India also begins to reduce regulation, substantially increasing the modernization and growth of its economy.

1995

The World Trade Organization comes into being, replacing GATT. It is a forum for trade negotiations, administering trade agreements, and handling trade disputes. Protests over globalization have centered on the WTO, with claims and counter-claims about its impact on the world economic order.

DOCUMENTS 1 & 2

Visual Primary Source Documents 1 & 2

Document 1



Library of Congress, Prints and Photographs Division,
LC-USZC2-6404

Document 2



Library of Congress, Prints and Photographs Division, LC-USZ62-104355

Information on Documents 1 & 2

Document 1 is a nineteenth-century artist's idea of a European explorer landing for the first time in an "undiscovered" locality, holding a flag and sword, pointing to a wooden cross and a carved pillar, claiming new lands in the name of king and Christianity. Native Americans stand among the explorers, and birch-bark canoes are pulled up on the shore. The illustration was created sometime between 1890 and 1910 by artist William Henry Lippencott.

Document 2 was made by engraver A. B. Greene in 1891. It depicts Spaniards executing Atahualpa, the last sovereign emperor of the Inca empire. This illustration shows Atahualpa being burned at the stake, while a monk stands to the right holding a crucifix. In fact, Spanish conquistador Francisco Pizarro captured Atahualpa and held him for a while in order to gain control over the Inca empire. Then in 1533, he sentenced Atahualpa to death by burning. When the Inca emperor converted to Christianity, he was strapped to a pole in an open space and strangled instead.