

*The*  
HISTORIAN'S  
APPRENTICE

# Ancient India

## Was There an Aryan Invasion?

by Jonathan Burack

---

Each unit in *The Historian's Apprentice* series deals with an important historical topic. It introduces students to a five-step set of practices designed to simulate the experience of a historian and make explicit all key phases of the historian's craft.

### ***The Historian's Apprentice: A Five-Step Process***

**1. Reflect on Your Prior Knowledge of the Topic.**

Students discuss what they already know and how their prior knowledge may shape or distort the way they view the topic.

**2. Apply Habits of Historical Thinking to the Topic.**

Students build background knowledge on the basis of five habits of thinking that historians use in constructing accounts of the past.

**3. Interpret the Relevant Primary Sources.**

Students apply a set of rules for interpreting sources and assessing their relevance and usefulness.

**4. Assess the Interpretations of Other Historians.**

Students learn to read secondary sources actively, with the goal of deciding among competing interpretations based on evidence in the sources.

**5. Interpret, Debate and Write About the Topic Yourself.**

Students apply what they have learned by constructing evidence-based interpretations of their own in a variety of ways.

**Samples are provided for evaluation purposes. Copying of the product or its parts for resale is prohibited. Additional restrictions may be set by the publisher.**

MindSparks®

CULVER CITY, CALIFORNIA



©2010 MindSparks, a division of Social Studies School Service  
All rights reserved

Printed in the United States of America

MindSparks  
10200 Jefferson Boulevard, P.O. Box 802  
Culver City, CA 90232-0802  
United States of America

(310) 839-2436  
(800) 421-4246

<http://mindsparks.com>  
[access@mindsparks.com](mailto:access@mindsparks.com)

Only those pages intended for student use as handouts may be reproduced by the teacher who has purchased this volume. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means—electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording—without prior written permission from the publisher.

ISBN: 978-1-57596-352-5  
Product Code: HS774 v2.0

# Teacher Introduction

## ★ *Teaching the Historian's Craft*

The goal of *The Historian's Apprentice* units is to expose students in a manageable way to the complex processes by which historians practice their craft. By modeling what historians do, students will practice the full range of skills that make history the unique and uniquely valuable challenge that it is.

Modeling the historian's craft is not the same as being a historian—something few students will become. Therefore, a scaffolding is provided here to help students master historical content in a way that will be manageable and useful to them.

Historical thinking is not a simple matter of reciting one fact after another, or even of mastering a single, authoritative account. It is disciplined by evidence, and it is a quest for truth; yet, historians usually try to

clarify complex realities and make tentative judgments, not to draw final conclusions. In doing so, they wrestle with imperfect sets of evidence (the primary sources), detect multiple meanings embedded in those sources, and take into account varying interpretations by other historians. They also recognize how wide a divide separates the present from earlier times. Hence, they work hard to avoid present-mindedness and to achieve empathy with people who were vastly different from us.

In their actual practice, historians are masters of the cautious, qualified conclusion. Yet they engage, use their imaginations, and debate with vigor. It is this spirit and these habits of craft that *The Historian's Apprentice* seeks to instill in students.

## ★ *The Historian's Apprentice: Five-Steps in Four Parts*

*The Historian's Apprentice* is a five-step process. However, the materials presented here are organized into four parts. Part I deals with the first two of the five steps of the process. Each of the other three parts then deals with one step in the process. Here is a summary of the four parts into which the materials are organized:

- Teacher Introduction.** Includes suggested day-by-day sequences for using these materials, including options for using the PowerPoint presentations. One sequence is designed for younger students and supplies a page of vocabulary definitions.
- Part 1.** A student warm-up activity, an introductory essay, a handout detailing a set of habits of historical thinking, and two PowerPoint presentations (*Five Habits of Historical Thinking* and *Ancient India: Was There an Aryan Invasion?*). Part 1 (including the PowerPoints) deals with *The Historian's Apprentice* Steps 1 and 2.
- Part 2.** A checklist for analyzing primary sources, several primary sources, and worksheets for analyzing them. Part 2 deals with *The Historian's Apprentice* Step 3.
- Part 3.** Two secondary source passages and two student activities analyzing those passages. Part 3 deals with *The Historian's Apprentice* Step 4.
- Part 4.** Two optional follow-up activities enabling students to write about and/or debate their own interpretations of the topic. Part 4 deals with *The Historian's Apprentice* Step 5.

## INTRODUCTION

### ★ *Suggested Five-Day Sequence*

Below is one possible way to use this *Historian's Apprentice* unit. Tasks are listed day by day in a sequence taking five class periods, with some homework and some optional follow-up activities.

**PowerPoint Presentation: *Five Habits of Historical Thinking***. This presentation comes with each *Historian's Apprentice* unit. If you have used it before with other units, you need not do so again. If you decide to use it, incorporate it into the **Day 1** activities. In either case, give students the “Five Habits of Historical Thinking” handout for future reference. Those Five Habits are as follows:

- History Is Not the Past Itself
- The Detective Model: Problem, Evidence, Interpretation
- Time, Change, and Continuity
- Cause and Effect
- As They Saw It: Grasping Past Points of View

**Warm-Up Activity: Homework assignment:** Students do the “Warm-Up Activity.” This activity explores student memories and personal experiences shaping their understanding of the topic.

**Day 1:** Discuss the “Warm-Up Activity.” Then either have students read or review the “Five Habits of Historical Thinking” handout, or use the *Five Habits* PowerPoint presentation.

**Homework assignment:** Students read the background essay “The Aryan Invasion Theory: Myth or Reality?”

**Day 2:** Use the second PowerPoint presentation, *Ancient India: Was There an Aryan Invasion?*, to overview the topic for this lesson. The presentation applies the Five Habits of Historical Thinking to this topic. Do the two activities embedded in the presentation.

**Homework assignment:** Students read the “Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist.” The checklist teaches a systematic way to handle sources:

- Sourcing
- Contextualizing
- Interpreting meanings
- Point of view
- Corroborating sources

**Day 3:** In class, students study some of the ten primary source documents and complete “Source Analysis” worksheets on them. They use their notes to discuss these sources. (Worksheet questions are all based on the concepts on the “Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist.”)

**Day 4:** In class, students complete the remaining “Source Analysis” worksheets and use their notes to discuss these sources. Take some time to discuss briefly the two secondary source passages students will analyze next.

**Homework assignment:** Students read these two secondary source passages.

**Day 5:** In class, students do the two “Secondary Sources” activities and discuss them. These activities ask them to analyze the two secondary source passages using four criteria:

- Clear focus on a problem or question
- Position or point of view
- Use of evidence or sources
- Awareness of alternative explanations

**Follow-Up Activities** (optional, at teacher discretion):

Do as preferred: the DBQ Essay Assignment and/or the Structured Debate.

## ★ *Suggested Three-Day Sequence*

If you have less time to devote to this lesson, here is a suggested shorter sequence. The sequence does not include the PowerPoint presentation *Five Habits of Historical Thinking*. This presentation is included with each *Historian's Apprentice* unit. If you have never used it with your class, you may want to do so before following this three-day sequence.

The three-day sequence leaves out a few activities from the five-day sequence. It also suggests that you use only seven key primary sources. Yet it still walks students through the steps in the *Historian's Apprentice* approach: Clarifying background knowledge, analyzing primary sources, comparing secondary sources, and debating or writing about the topic.

**Warm-Up Activity. Homework assignment:** Ask students to read or review the “Five Habits of Historical Thinking” handout and read the background essay “The Aryan Invasion Theory.”

**Day 1:** Use the PowerPoint presentation *Ancient India: Was There an Aryan Invasion?* It overviews the topic for this lesson by applying the Five Habits of Historical Thinking to it. Do the two activities embedded in the presentation.

**Homework assignment:** Students read or review the “Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist.” The checklist teaches a systematic way to handle sources.

**Day 2:** In class, students study some of the ten primary source documents and complete “Source Analysis” worksheets on them. They use their notes to discuss these sources. We suggest using Documents 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, and 10.

You may wish to make your own choices of primary sources. Use your judgment in deciding how many of them your students can effectively analyze in a single class period.

**Homework assignment:** Students read the two secondary source passages.

**Day 3:** In class, students do the two “Secondary Sources” activities and discuss them. These activities ask them to analyze the two secondary source passages using four criteria.

**Follow-Up Activities** (optional, at teacher discretion):

Do as preferred: the DBQ Essay Assignment and/or the Structured Debate.

## INTRODUCTION

### ★ *Suggestions for Use with Younger Students*

For younger students, parts of this lesson may prove challenging. If you feel your students need a somewhat more manageable path through the material, see the suggested sequence below.

If you want to use the *Five Habits of Historical Thinking* PowerPoint presentation, this sequence takes four class periods. If you do not use this PowerPoint, you can combine **Day 1** and **Day 2** and keep the sequence to just three days. We suggest using six primary sources only. The ones listed for **Day 3** are less demanding in terms of vocabulary and conceptual complexity. For **Day 4**, we provide some simpler DBQs for the follow-up activities.

**Vocabulary:** A list of vocabulary terms in the sources and the introductory essay is provided on page 7 of this booklet. You may wish to hand this sheet out as a reading reference. Or you could make flashcards out of some of the terms. Or you might ask each of several small groups to use the vocabulary sheet to explain terms in one source to the rest of the class.

### SUGGESTED FOUR-DAY SEQUENCE

**Warm-Up Activity. Homework assignment:** Students do the “Warm-Up Activity.” This activity explores student memories and personal experiences shaping their understanding of the topic.

**Day 1:** Discuss the “Warm-Up Activity.” Show the *Five Habits of Historical Thinking* PowerPoint presentation (unless you have used it before and/or you do not think it is needed now). If you do not use this PowerPoint presentation, give students the “Five Habits of Historical Thinking” handout and discuss it with them.

**Homework assignment:** Ask students to read the background essay “The Aryan Invasion Theory: Myth or Reality?”

**Day 2:** Use the PowerPoint presentation *Ancient India: Was There an Aryan Invasion?* This introduces the topic for the lesson by applying the Five Habits of Historical Thinking to it. Do the two activities embedded in the presentation.

**Homework assignment:** Students read or review the “Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist.” The checklist teaches a systematic way to handle sources.

**Day 3:** Discuss the “Interpreting Primary Sources Checklist” and talk through one primary source document in order to illustrate the meaning of the concepts on the checklist. Then have students complete “Source Analysis” worksheets after studying primary source documents 2, 3, 6, 7, 9, and 10.

**Homework assignment:** Students read the two secondary source passages.

**Day 4:** Students do *only* “Secondary Sources: Activity 2” and discuss it. This activity asks them to choose from among the sources the two that best back up each secondary source passage.

**Follow-Up Activities** (optional, at teacher discretion):

Do as preferred: the DBQ Essay Assignment and/or the Structured Debate.

Here are some alternate DBQs tailored to the six primary sources recommended here:

**Compare the views of Hindutva nationalists with those of most historians who are not Hindutva supporters. How are they alike and not alike?**

**“The language clues about Indo-Europeans are not enough to prove or disprove the Aryan invasion theory.” Do you agree or disagree with this statement? Why?**

## Vocabulary: The Introductory Essay

- **decipher:** To decode or fully determine the meaning of a set of symbols, such as a language
- **ethnic group:** A group that shares a language, customs, and a sense of common identity
- **migrate:** To move a long distance
- **ritual:** A specific act or performance done according to religious law
- **steppe:** A vast, flat, and fairly treeless grassland
- **theory:** A likely or scientific explanation of a set of facts and their relationships
- **Vedas:** The four earliest sacred texts of Hinduism (the *Rig Veda* is the first of these)

## Vocabulary: The Primary Sources

- **aboriginal:** The earliest or first of its kind; also, primitive
- **acrimony:** Angry disagreement
- **affinity:** In this case, similarity
- **brachycephalic:** Relatively short-headed or broad-headed
- **chauvinism:** In this case, a sense of cultural or national superiority.
- **corroded:** In this case, worn down and destroyed
- **dolichocephalic:** Relatively long-headed
- **exquisite:** Very fine, delicate
- **insidious:** Describes something harmful that develops slowly and is hard to notice
- **nationalism:** Strong loyalty to a nation; also, the belief a single ethnic group should have its own nation
- **philology:** The study of language as it is used in literature
- **ruse:** A trick or attempt to deceive
- **ulterior:** Beyond what is said openly; hidden
- **upstart:** Someone or some group that has risen suddenly in power and prestige, or claims to

## Vocabulary: The Secondary Sources

- **ascertain:** Learn or clearly define
- **archaeology:** The study of the material remains of older human societies
- **consensus:** A complete or nearly complete agreement among a group of people
- **contemporaneous:** Existing at the same time as
- **continuity:** Something that stays the same over time
- **corpus:** A complete body of written works
- **definitive:** Final or completely satisfactory
- **equation:** In this case, the claim that two things are the same
- **indigenous:** Native to a place
- **intensive:** Strengthened or emphasized
- **linguistics:** The study of language as a whole
- **lineal:** In a straight line, direct
- **prevailing:** The most convincing

## INTRODUCTION

# Part 1: India and the Aryans—Providing the Context

**Note to the teacher:** The next pages provide materials meant to help students better understand and evaluate debates about the Aryan invasion theory. The materials also seek to teach students the Five Habits of Historical Thinking.

This section includes the following:

- **PowerPoint presentation: *The Five Habits of Historical Thinking***

This presentation illustrates five habits of thought or modes of analysis that guide historians as they construct their secondary accounts of a topic. These five habits are not about skills used in analyzing primary sources (those are dealt with more explicitly in another handout in the next section). The Five Habits are meant to help students see history as a way of thinking, not as the memorizing of disparate facts and predigested conclusions. The PowerPoint uses several historical episodes as examples to illustrate the Five Habits. In two places, it pauses to ask students to do a simple activity applying one of the habits to some of their own life experiences.

If you have used this PowerPoint with other *Historian's Apprentice* units, you may not need to use it again here.

- **Handout: “The Five Habits of Historical Thinking”**

This handout supplements the PowerPoint presentation. It is meant as a reference for students to use as needed. If you have used other *Historian's Apprentice* units, your students may only need to review this handout quickly.

- **Warm-Up Activity**

A simple exercise designed to help you see what students know about the topic, what confuses them, or what ideas they may have absorbed about it from popular culture, friends and family, etc. The goal is to alert them to their need to gain a clearer idea of the past and be critical of what they think they already know.

- **Introductory essay: “The Aryan Invasion: Myth or Reality?”**

The essay provides enough basic background information on the topic to enable students to assess primary sources and conflicting secondary source interpretations. At the end of the essay, students get some points to keep in mind about the nature of the sources they will examine and the conflicting secondary source interpretations they will debate.

- **PowerPoint presentation: *Ancient India: Was There an Aryan Invasion?***

This PowerPoint presentation reviews the topic for the lesson and shows how the Five Habits of Historical Thinking can be applied to a clearer understanding of it. At two points, the presentation calls for a pause and students are prompted to discuss some aspects of their prior knowledge of the topic. Our proposed sequences suggest using this PowerPoint presentation after assigning the introductory essay, but you may prefer to reverse this order.



# Warm-Up Activity

## *What Do You Know About Indian History?*

This lesson deals with a theory about the history of ancient India. Whenever you start to learn something about a time in history, it helps to think first of what you already know about it, or think you know. You probably have impressions. Or you may have read or heard things about it already. Some of what you know may be accurate. You need to be ready to alter your fixed ideas about this time as you learn more about it. This is what any historian would do. To do this, study this illustration and take a few notes in response to the questions below it.



This is a photograph of one of the most famous buildings in India, the Taj Mahal. What do you know about it, who built it, and why it was built?

The Taj Mahal was built by Mughal emperor Shah Jahan in memory of his favorite wife. It is a fine example of Mughal architecture. This style of architecture combines Persian, Indian, and Islamic styles. In fact, Shah Jahan was a Muslim, even though most Indians were Hindus. Does knowing this surprise you? What else do you know about the role of Islam in India's history?

Many historians say that long before Islam and Muslims came to India, another group called Aryans arrived—perhaps as long ago as 1700 BCE or even earlier. According to these historians, the Aryans brought religious rituals and beliefs that led to Hinduism itself. In India, however, many people argue about this “Aryan invasion theory.” What do you know about this argument? Why do you think Indians argue about it?